

An Intertextual Analysis of Otherness in Sadeghi's *The Heavenly Kingdom* and Esmaili's "In between Empty Hollows": A Bakhtinian Reading

Majid Houshang¹ 
Sepideh Yeganeh²

Extended Abstract

In literary studies, the dialogue between philosophy and literature will lead the audience to an intermediate understanding of these two fields, and new windows will be opened to critics in the dialogue between these two fields of humanities. In interdisciplinary analysis and by entering the field of intertextuality, the scope of this understanding will be understood in a wider way among disciplines and texts. In this regard, the examination of Bakhtin's system of thought in the field of philosophical anthropology and the theory of "otherness" and the interpretation of literary texts with this point of view are important issues that emphasize the need to avoid the bipolar system and the refusal of man to know his "self" without interacting with "the other". In this research, we analyze the two narratives of Bahram Sadeghi's *Malakout* and the "Miyān Hofrehaye Khali" of the Ismaili treaty through a descriptive and analytical method. The problem of the research is studying the relationship between these two entities in the two narratives of *Malakout* by Bahram Sadeghi and *Miyān Hofrehaye Khali* of the Ismaili Treaty (1356) and what the nature of this relationship system in the discourse understanding of these two narratives is. Can it be categorized and defined? Therefore, this article tries to answer this basic issue through a descriptive-analytical method.

One of the important results of this research is that both narratives are based on a medical journey; one of which can be defined in the pole of "self" by relying on the institution of consciousness, and the other appears in the position of "other" by relying on cultural and ethnic contrast. In the course of the narration, Yabada and True both change their pole systems, with the difference that the people of the city in the narration of "*Malakout*" remain in a different pole from the beginning to the

¹ Assistant Professor of Persian Language and Literature, Department of Persian Language and Literature, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran (corresponding author). m.houshang@alzahra.ac.ir

² Assistant Professor of Persian Language and Literature, Department of Persian Language and Literature, Alzahra University, Tehran, Iran s.yegane@alzahra.ac.ir

How to cite this article:

Majid Houshang; Sepideh Yeganeh. "An Intertextual Analysis of "Otherness" in Bahram Sadeghi's "the Heavenly Kingdom" and Peyman Esmaili's "In between Empty Hollows": A Bakhtinian Reading". *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature, Arts and Humanities*, 3, 2, 2023, 149-172. doi: 10.22077/islah.2023.6361.1276



Copyright: © 2023 by the authors. Licensee Journal of *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature, Arts & Humanities*. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

end of the narration, and that in the narration of the Malakout this is due to the type of its surreal moves towards the fluid. In both stories, the element of letter writing plays a central role in the action, dialogue, and confrontation between “self” and “other”. In the narrative, the “ Malakout “ of oneself and another can be interpreted and explained in a human institution, and its examples are personal. But in the short story “Miyān Hofrehaye Khali”, “Self” has an ethnic entity.

On the other hand, the “other” emerged from the national macro-institution and is unfamiliar with the ethnic institution and has no desire to communicate with it and respect its laws, causing confusion in “his” system. The locations of both narratives indicate a kind of unfamiliarity and foreignness, which are implicitly different based on the genre nature of each. In the narrative of “Malakout”, the surreal and abstract atmosphere of the situations set the story in a city where signs such as darkness, namelessness, silence, and ambiguity... place the story in the “other” pole. It is strengthened by overlapping its inhabitants, contrary to the tradition of narration in similar subjects, which expresses the sojourn of man in the fallen world and the situation of human decline. However, in the narration of “Miyān Hofrehaye Khali”, the story is told in a cold region with impassable mountain ranges, which, ironically, is remote and less known - and in most cases, cold.

This extreme coldness and the lack of resilience of the “other” in it can be a symbol of the coldness and limitation of the human relations of the people in that social institution, a symbol of the isolation of “self” on the basis of which the author presents an image of the mutual relations of ethnicity in the position of “self” and nationality in the position of “other”. It , also, shows that bipolar communication policies not only do not cause the growth of social institutions, but also create the basis for the isolation of social poles, separation from the macro-institution of society, self-aggrandizement, deep confrontations in the horizon of vision and conflict between them as long as one comes after the destruction of “the other”. The important point in both narratives is the emptying of the place, which is realized in both narratives and in the ending, a sign of the loss of “self”.

Another point is the difference between the two narratives in the certainty of one’s pole and the other, which in the “Malakout” narrative crosses the boundaries of certainty and becomes a fluid matter. The process of transformation in the characters of Malkut’s narrative is also going on against each other and their movement is going on against each other symbolically and meaningfully. However, in the narration of “Miyān Hofrehaye Khali”, according to the certainty in the bipolar view, all aspects are divided into two poles, good and bad, and always good belongs to “self” and bad applies to “others”.

References:

Aqaebrahimi, Niloufar and Farhad Sasani and Farzan Sojoodi (2019) Baznemaeye

khod va digari dar Roman Farsi: Khod Irani va Digari Qeire Irani dar Se Romane Tangsir, Souvashon va Hamsayeha. Zabanpajohi. (Representation of self and other in Persian novel: Iranian self and non-Iranian other in three novels Tangsir, Souvashon va Hamsayeha). Journal of language research.[In Persian]

Ahmadi, Babak (1996) Sakhtar Tavile Matn, Neshanehshenasi va Sakhtageraee. (Structure of text interpretation, semiotics and structuralism). 1, Tehran: Markaz. .[In Persian]

Esmaeli, Peiman(2017) Barf va Samfoni Abri, (Snow and cloud symphony), Tehran: Cheshmeh. .[In Persian]

Akbarizadeh, Fatemeh and Kobra Roshanfeker and Khalil Parvini and Hoseiali Ghobadi (2014) Barrasiye Ashkale Goftegomandi ye Zaban dar Do Romane Zanane ye Pirzad va Mostqanami,(Investigating the forms of conversational language in two women's novels by Pirzad and Mostaghanami). Nameye Farhangestan. 14. 1. autumn and winter. Pp. 9-35. .[In Persian]

Ansari, Mansour (2005) Dmokrasiye Goftegoee.(Dialogue democracy). Tehran: Markaz. .[In Persian]

Anoushirvani, Alireza (2013) Motaleaate Beinareshei Adabiyate Tatbiqi. (Interdisciplinary studies of comparative literature). Comparative Literature (Persian Language and Literature Academy). 7. spring and summer. Pp.3-9. .[In Persian]

Bakhtin, Mikhail (2008) Takhayyol Mokalemei Dar Jostarhaee Darbareye Roman. (Conversational imagination in essays about the novel). Trans by Roya Pourazar. Tehran: Nashre Nei. .[In Persian]

..... (2001) Sodaye Mokalemeh, Kandeh, Azadi. (conversation, laughter, freedom).Trans by Mohammad Jafar Payandeh. Tehran: Cheshmeh.

Behzadfar, Mostafa (2013) Hoviyate Shahr: Negahi be Hoviyate Shahre Tehran. (The identity of the city: a look at the identity of the city of Tehran). Tehran: Nashre Shahre Tehran. .[In Persian]

Pournamdariyan, Tqi and Roqayye Hashemi (2012) Tahlile Daštane Malakut Ba Takye bar Maktabe Ravan Tahlili.(Analyzing the story of Melkot based on psychoanalytic library) Persian Language and Literature Journal, Sanandaj Branch Azad University, 4. 10. Pp137-156. .[In Persian]

Todorov, Tzvetan (2014) Manteqe Goftegoee Bakhtin. (Mikhail Bakhtin: the dialogical principle) Trans by Daryush Karimi, Tehran: Markaz. .[In Persian]

Rahe Haq. Donya va Reza Akbari nouri va Hasan Abniki (2020) Chgonegiye Rabeteye Khod/Digari dar Irane Sadeye Akhir: Karbaste Olgouye Bakhtin va Rahyafte Shantal Mouf. (Qualities of self / other relationship in Iran in the last

- century: using Bakhtin model and Chantal Moff approach) 15. 3. 59.pp 77-116. .[In Persian]
- Raminniya, Maryam and Hoseinali Ghobadi (2011) Mafhoume Digari va Digarboudegi dar Ensanshenasi Bakhtin va Ensanshenasi Erfani (Concept of 'Another Person' in Anthropology of Bakhtin and Mystical Anthropology) *Literary Research*. 10. 40. Pp 63- 88. .[In Persian]
- Sartre, Jean-Paul (2010) *Adabiyyat Chist? (What Is Literature?)* Trans by Abolhasan Najafi and Mostafa Rahimi, Tehran: Niloufar. .[In Persian]
- Sabzevari, Mollahadi (2004) *Asrar o alhekam*, Qom: Matbouaate dini. .[In Persian]
- Sajjadi, Seyyed Jafar (1994) *Farhang Maarefe Eslami*, (The culture of Islamic education) 1. Tehran: Entesharate Daneshgah Tehran. .[In Persian]
- Sadeqi, Bahram (2000) *Malakut*, Tehran: Ketabe Zaman. .[In Persian]
- Sanaati, Mohammad (2001) *Tahlile Ravanshenakhti dar Honar va Adabiyyat*, Tehran: Markaz. .[In Persian]
- Azizi, Nadiya and Reza Sadeqi Shahpar (2020) *Surrealism dar Roman Malakut Bahram Sadeqi. (Surrealism in Bahram Sadeghi's Novel Malakoot)* *Research Journal of Literary Schools*, 4. 10. Pp: 66- 93. .[In Persian]
- Azime, Saleh (2009) *Manashenasi vajegane qoraan. (Semantics of Quranic words)* Mashhad: Beh Nashr. .[In Persian]
- Azimi, Hosein and Masoud Olya (2012) *Nesbate Matn va Sedaye Digari dar Andisheye Bakhtin. (The Relation of Text and the Other in Bakhtin's Thought)* *Kimiya-ye-Honar*. 3. 13. Pp: 7-16. .[In Persian]
- Gholamhoseinzadeh, Gharibreza and Negar Gholampour (2008) *Mikhael Bakhtin: Zendege, Andisheha va Mafahime Bonyadin, (Mikhail Bakhtin: life, ideas and fundamental concepts)* Tehran: Rouzegar. .[In Persian]
- Fokouhi, Naser (2007) *Tarikhe Andisheha va Nazariyehaye Ensanshenasi, (History of anthropological ideas and theories)* Tehran: Nashre Nei. .[In Persian]
- Lotfniya, Hamideh (2021) *Tasvirshenasi dar Adabiyyate Tatbiqu: Shenakht Khod az Negahe Digari. (Imagology in comparative literature : Knowing yourself from another perspective)* *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature, Arts and Humanities*, 1.1. spring and summer. Pp: 135-155. .[In Persian]
- Latifpour, Abdollah and Ali Dehqan and Hamidreza Farzi (2017) *Taqabol va Taaamole Khod va Digari Dar Romane Madaram Do Bar Gerist az Ebrami Yonesi. (The confrontation and interaction of "self" and "other" in the novel "My mother is two burdens" by Ebrahim Yonesi)* *Contemporary Persian Literature Journal*, 7. 3. Pp: 71-92. .[In Persian]

- Husserl, Edmund (2007) *Taammolate Dekarti. (Cartesian Meditations)* Trans by Abdolkarim Rashidiyan, Tehran: Nashre Nei. .[In Persian]
- Holquist, Michael (2016) *Mokalemehgeraee Mikhail Bakhtin va Jahanash. (DialogismBakhtin and His World(Trans by Mehdi Amir KHanlo. Tehran: Niloufar. .[In Persian]*
- Bakhtin, M (1999), *Problem's of Dostoevsky's poetics*, Translated by Caryl Emerson, Minnesota: University of Minnesota press.
- Bakhtin, M (1993) *Toward a Philosophy of the Act*, V. Liapunov (trans.), Austin: Texas university press.
- Lacan, Jacques (1979), *Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis*, Jacques-Allen Miller, ed.,Alen Sheridan, trans., Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd.
- Ljungberg, Ch. (2011). *Meeting the cultural other: semiotic approaches to intercultural communication*. In F. Sojoodi (Ed.), *Cultural Semiotics* (pp. 59-77). Tehran: Elm [in Persian].
- Levinas, Emmanuel (1994) *Outside the Subject*, Stanford: Stanford university press

