

A Comparative Study of Metalepsis in the Novel and Film "The Book Thief" Based on the Model of Julian Hanebeck

Payam Zinalabedini¹ 

Fatemeh Ahmadi²

Abstract

Metalepsis, which causes transgression between levels of narrative, can be transmitted from one medium to another as a special type of narrative. At the origin, it appears in a different form at the destination. Although the properties of metalepsis have been considered in the postmodern situation, extensive research on it in the ancient cultures of the world shows that the use of this method in literature and art has a long history. In today's era, since the desire to read and see postmodern works has increased, the need to recognize and adapt the characteristics of these works in literature and cinema is also developing. The present study has examined this procedure from literature to cinema and its concern is to investigate the transmission of written metalepsis to visual metalepsis. The present study aims to analyze the signs and effects of metalepsis, including immersion, aesthetic illusion, and how to break the fourth wall in the transition from literature to cinema. The research method is qualitative with a narrative research approach. Therefore, the novel and the movie *The Book Thief* have been studied in a comparative way to identify the cognitive schemas of the levels in the work. The result shows that, in the novel with continued metalepsis, we usually encounter even minimal transgression and sometimes stronger signs. In the film, since most of the narrative is carried out by a neutral camera, unlike in the novel, we do not encounter continued metalepsis, and only occasionally does metalepsis occur with intense and obvious signs.

Keywords: Metalepsis, Narrative Levels, *The Book Thief*, Diegetic Universes, Immersive Metalepsis

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Performing Arts, School of Performing Arts and Music, College of Fine Arts, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran., (Corresponding Author), payam.zinalabedin@ut.ac.ir.

² Fatemeh Ahmadi, A Master's student in Cinema, Kamal-Ol-Molk University Nowshahr, Iran. f.ahmadi92@gmail.com

How to cite this article:

payam Zinalabedini; Fatemeh Ahmadi. "A Comparative Study of Metalepsis in the Novel and Film "The Book Thief" Based on the Model of Julian Hanebeck". *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature, Arts and Humanities*, 3, 2, 2023, 191-218. doi: 10.22077/islah.2023.6744.1334



Copyright: © 2023 by the authors. Licensee Journal of *Interdisciplinary Studies of Literature, Arts & Humanities*. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

Extended Abstract

1. Introduction

Metalepsis is a certain type of narration that can cause a transgression between narrative levels and deny the classical and expected order of the narrative structure. This phenomenon, which has recently attracted the attention of many narratologists around the world, can be produced and recreated in various narrative media, including literature, cinema, painting, and more. Although there have been detailed studies on the investigation of metalepsis in the literature, and numerous ancient, modern, and postmodern texts have been analyzed, there are few studies in media like cinema and other arts. Therefore, by understanding this research gap at the international level, the importance and implementation of such research become more apparent. The significance of comparative studies stems from their ability to interpret the apparent and implicit distinctions between film and literature. In addition, the necessity to identify and adapt postmodern features in literature and film is growing as the demand to read and view postmodern works of art has grown in recent years. Therefore, it will be easier to create cinematic adaptations of literary works that exhibit metalepsis traits by using such an interdisciplinary approach.

2. Aim

In order to show how metalepsis behaves in an intermedia transfer, the current research aims to study the text and the image comparatively with the approach of narrative research from an innovative perspective. Examining metalepsis within a medium (literature, for example) might disclose a wide spectrum of metalepsis performance; however, examining this phenomenon throughout the process of transfer from one medium to another can reveal novel behaviors. By examining the narrative potentials in the novel and film, the research problem is to find out how to transfer written metalepsis to visual metalepsis. The current study aims to examine the indicators and consequences of metalepsis, such as immersion, aesthetic illusion, breaking the fourth wall, and the use of *mise en abyme* (a story within a story) in the literary-to-film transition. Consequently, a comparative analysis of the novel and film *The Book Thief* will be conducted, along with a structural and content analysis of the narrative in both works.

3. Theoretical Framework and Methodology

The Julian Hanebeck model has been selected for the current qualitative study's theoretical framework since it includes the required nuances and can be crucial in providing the results in the best possible way. With the help of earlier metalepsis models and a keen understanding of the more intricate aspects of this phenomenon, Julian Hanebeck has been able to provide a rather comprehensive model that addresses a larger variety of narrative violations. It is clear that more comprehensive models of

metalepsis will develop in future and novel forms and dimensions of metalepsis will be classified .

4. Discussion

This study demonstrates how the director alters the narrative's framework to change the metalepsis that is created in the film. Notably, comparable instruments have been discovered thus far for the production of metalepsis in literary and cinematic works. However, even though certain instruments are capable of generating written metalepsis in the form of an image, the type, intensity, and impact of metalepsis will vary based on the form and likelihood of its manifestation within the image frame. The type and intensity of written metalepsis in the transmission to visual metalepsis fluctuate; consequently, the visual metalepsis might differ depending on how the filmmaker chooses to retain or not preserve the novel's themes and narrative structure. The author produces a brief pause in the narrative by altering the context of the book's words (short explanatory texts), which creates a kind of rhetorical metalepsis. Additionally, by using the *mise en abyme* technique, he adds an inner level to the story, which is distinguished from the main body of the narrative by changing the font and adding a painting. The only figure who tells the story and makes repeated trips to the fictional world in the novel is the narrator, who provides a framework for creating the ontological metalepsis. The novel's consistent narrative structure will make the audience's immersion more stable, which will lead to the creation of an aesthetic illusion. Unlike the novel, we are not confronted with uniform metalepsis in the film; instead, violations are only occasionally highlighted with strong, obvious indicators. This is because the majority of the narrative is carried out by the neutral camera.

5. Findings and Conclusion

The outcome demonstrates that in the novel we are faced with uniform metalepsis, even to a minimum extent, and occasionally with more pronounced indications. A filmmaker can depict the intended metalepsis more intensely by integrating the various narrative elements at their disposal, which include voice (audio narration), images, music, editing, decoupage, etc. In general, the narrative tools available in any medium can play an essential role in performing or re-creating metalepsis. In cinema, due to the benefit of various narrative tools, metalepsis can be implemented in newer types, which should be analyzed in detail. The purpose of this research is to open a new window to the subject, which highlights the necessity of examining it as much as possible in the future.

Keywords: Metalepsis, Narrative Levels, The Book Thief, Diegetic Universes, Immersive Metalepsis

References:

- Bell, Alice & Jan Alber (2012). "Ontological metalepsis and unnatural narratology". *Journal of Narrative Theory*, 42:2, pp. 166-192. <https://doi.org/10.1353/jnt.2012.0005>
- Cohn, Dorrit (2012). "Metalepsis and mise en abyme." Trans. Lewis S. Gleich. *Narrative*, 20:1, pp. 105-114. <https://doi.org/10.1353/nar.2012.0003>
- Elleström, Lars (2019). *Transmedial narration: Narratives and stories in different media*. Springer Nature. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-01294-6>
- Hanebeck, Julian (2017). *Understanding Metalepsis: The Hermeneutics of Narrative Transgression*. Berlin/Boston: De Gruyter. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110516920>
- Lam, Celia (2014). "Breaking the fourth wall: dynamics of fan fiction production." *Living in the Limelight: Dynamics of the Celebrity Experience*. Edited by Kyo-Patrick R. Hart. Brill, pp. 75-85. https://doi.org/10.1163/9781848883963_009
- Lutas, Liviu (2021). "Metalepsis in Different Media." *Beyond Media Borders*. Edited by Lars Elleström, 2: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 149-173. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-49683-86>
- Ryan, Marie-Laure (2006). *Avatars of Story*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Oliveira, Débora Almeida de & Maggio, Sandra Sirangelo (2017). "The deadly perception of the witness: Focalization in Markus Zusak's the Book Thief." *Ilha do Desterro A Journal of English Language Literatures in English and Cultural Studies*, 70:1, pp. 135-142. <https://doi.org/10.5007/2175-8026.2017v70n1p135>.
- Pier, John (2009). "Metalepsis." *Handbook of narratology*. Edited by Peter Hühn, and Jan Christoph Meister, and John Pier, and Wolf Schmid, and Jörg Schönert. Hamburg: Hamburg University. pp. 190-203. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110217445.190>
- Pier, John (2016). "Metalepsis." *The living handbook of narratology*, pp. 1-21 (revised version; uploaded 13 July 2016). <https://www-archiv.fdm.uni-hamburg.de/lhn/printpdf/article/metalepsis-revised-version-uploaded-13-july-2016>
- Wolf, Werner (2009). "Illusion (aesthetic)." *Handbook of narratology*. Edited by Peter Hühn, and Jan Christoph Meister, and John Pier, and Wolf Schmid, and Jörg Schönert. Hamburg: Hamburg University. pp. 144-160. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110217445.144>
- Wolf, Werner (2013). "Unnatural Metalepsis and Immersion: Necessarily Incompatible?" *A Poetics of Unnatural Narrative*. Edited by Henrik Skov Nielsen, Jan Alber, and Brian Richardson. Columbus: Ohio State UP. pp. 113-141.